

October 7, 2015

VIA EMAIL

Bill Honig and Nancy McTygue, Co-Chairs
History-Social Science Subject Matter Committee
Instructional Quality Commission
1430 N Street, Suite #5111
Sacramento, CA 95814
Email: hssframework@cde.ca.gov

RE: History-Social Science Framework Revisions To Be Discussed on October 8-9, 2015; Remaining Priority Line Edits Related to FAIR Education Act

Dear Co-Chairs Honig and McTygue:

In advance of the History-Social Science Subject Matter Committee meeting on October 8 and 9, 2015, we wanted to share our feedback as representatives from LGBT community organizations on the revisions you have made to the History-Social Science Framework.

First, we want to commend you on the tremendous advances you have made in this most recent revision of the History-Social Science Framework. It is clear to us that you have taken great care to review our suggested edits in an effort to reflect and honor the legislative intent behind the FAIR Education Act with regard to including the roles and contributions of LGBT Americans in history and social science instruction.

We applaud you for the substantial revisions you have made to include the roles and contributions of LGBT Americans, including key historical figures, a number of essential moments in the struggle for LGBT equality, and the evolution of LGBT communities and identities. We are pleased to see references to LGBT Americans and matters of LGBT equality in multiple grade levels throughout the elementary, middle, and high school grades. The revisions you have made, which reflect the current scholarship on LGBT history, are historic and important contributions to the education of California's K-12 students.

However, from our analysis of which recommended edits were not incorporated, we are concerned about a number of suggested edits that were omitted. In particular, these omissions neglect what should be a more intersectional understanding of LGBT identities and communities with regard to gender and race over time. Foremost, we are concerned that you have not included any of the references to Two Spirit people during discussions of Native Californian or Early American tribes and the effects of colonization. Additionally, there are relatively few specific mentions of lesbian, bisexual, and especially transgender Americans. Important historical events and individuals in the struggle for equality for transgender Americans that have been omitted are essential for helping today's students understand this emerging civil rights issue. While we were

pleased to see some progress with regard to including LGBT people of color (e.g. Bayard Rustin) who have figured prominently in history, there is also still very little visibility of the concerns of LGBT people of color throughout US and California history, which is essential given the need to represent and reflect both the increasing racial and ethnic diversity of our student population and the diverse realities of the American past.

Lastly, we urge you to use consistent language and modern terminology when referring to LGBT Americans. The full list of “lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender Americans” should be included rather than simply “gay” or “gay and lesbian.” Transgender people should be described using respectful language that does not demean them or imply that their identities were deceitful or inauthentic in any way. References to “marriage equality” should be clear about being a matter concerning “marriage for same-sex couples.” Additionally, any place that the text refers to categories of diversity or categories of people protected under civil rights laws or in the movements for equal rights should be consistent in their inclusion of sexual orientation and gender identity.

To address these remaining concerns, we have provided a complete list of the line edits that we strongly recommend be incorporated into your edits of the History-Social Science Framework. We have presented our recommendations in the order that they would appear in the document, by page number and line number. (For cross-reference purposes, we have included the original number of our corresponding public comment from the May 2014 meeting.) These suggested edits remain of the highest priority related to LGBT history, and align with our priority recommended edits from our letter dated December 16, 2014.

Original Public Comment #	New Location (Chapter, Page #)	Our Suggested Line Edit
n/a	Intro, p. 6	Lines 116-117 should be revised to: “...marriage equality to same-sex couples in the twenty-first century.”
n/a	Intro, p. 20	Lines 425-426 should be revised to: “...all persons as equals regardless of ethnicity, gender identity, sexual orientation, and beliefs.”
1199	Grade 2, p. 60	Lines 28-29 should be revised to read: “...families with lesbian, gay, bisexual, or transgender parents.”
1198	Grade 2, p. 61	Line 48, add "The Great Big Book of Families by Mary Hoffman".
1233	Grade 4, p. 93	Line 246, insert: “Teachers may also explore the ways in which Spanish missionaries worked to fundamentally alter Native Californian cultures by trying to eliminate gender and sexuality identities and practices among the Indians that Spanish felt were unacceptable.”
1230 (with minor edit to reflect Carolyn Laub’s	Grade 4, p. 95	On line 290, insert new paragraph: “By exploring Native Californian cultures, students also learn that some Native California cultures accepted third gender roles for females who preferred to assume men’s social roles and males who assumed women’s social roles. Such gender diversity often did not fit well

version of the comment)		with the gender order of Spanish missionaries.” Teachers can discuss how tribes such as the Klamath, Tolowa, Yuki, Gabrielino, and Chumash recognized males who preferred to dress and live as women and, in some cases, women who preferred to dress and live as men. Some California tribes granted such two-spirit people important spiritual and social roles, sometimes including marriage. To exemplify how the Spanish did not accept such Native Californian traditions, teachers and students could explore the well-documented 18th-century case of a Chumash male-to-female person who, after Santa Clara Mission friars ordered the person to give up women's clothing and work, ran away from the Mission and resumed a two-spirit identity in the tribe.”
1235	Grade 4, p. 99	<p>Line 370-378 should be revised to: “...stagecoach driver Charley Parkhurst, who was born as a female but who lived as a male, and who drove stagecoach routes in northern and central California for almost 30 years. Stagecoaches were the only way many people could travel long distances, and they served as a vital communication link between isolated communities. Parkhurst was one of the most famous California drivers, having survived multiple robberies while driving (and later killing a thief when he tried to rob Parkhurst a second time).”</p> <p>The sentences on lines 376-378 should be deleted, so that offensive and inaccurate language stating Parkhurst was “actually a woman and mother” are removed. While Parkhurst was birth-assigned female and gave birth to a child, there is no historical certainty that Parkhurst was “actually a woman,” nor took on the social gender role of “mother.” LGBT historical scholarship exercises great caution with such terms, and urges those drafting Framework revisions to follow this best practice.</p>
1407	Grade 8, p. 328	Line 384 should be revised to: “...close, and sometimes romantic, bonds with one another...”
1414	Grade 8, p. 349	The sentences on lines 645-647 should be deleted, so that offensive and inaccurate language stating Parkhurst was “actually a woman and mother” are removed.
1420	Grade 8, p. 363	Line 938, revise to: “...Native American social systems related to governance, family diversity, and gender diversity, <u>including two-spirit traditions</u> .”
1458	Grade 9, p. 415	Line 692, insert: “...and they can study how different social movements for people of color, women, and LGBT communities have mutually informed each other.”
1535	Grade 9, p. 502	Line 15, should not have a comma after the word “gender.” So it should now read: “...changes in racial, ethnic, and gender, dynamics in American society...”
1556	Grade 11, p. 551	Line 1010, insert: “Students can see the contradiction between the image of domestic contentment and challenges to the sex and gender system through the publication of and responses to the Kinsey reports on male and female sexuality in 1948 and 1953;

		the publicity surrounding Christine Jorgensen, the “ex-G.I.” transformed into a “blonde beauty” through sex-reassignment surgery in 1952; the efforts of the medical profession to enforce proper marital heterosexuality; and the growth of LGBT cultures.”
1556	Grade 11, p. 554	Line 1031, update to include full LGBT community: “...as well as women and lesbian, gay, <u>bisexual</u> , and <u>transgender people</u> ...”
1574 (plus new suggestion from Dec 16, 2014 letter)	Grade 11, p. 563	Line 1242, to give educators specific and diverse lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender leaders to consider, insert: “Consider figures such as Alfred Kinsey, Harry Hay, José Sarria, Del Martin and Phyllis Lyon, Frank Kameny, Sylvia Rivera, and Harvey Milk.”
1574 (plus new suggestion from Dec 16, 2014 letter)	Grade 11, p. 564	Line 1255, add landmark transgender-related decisions: “...and <i>Obergefell v. Hodges</i>), and the constitutional guarantee of equal protection under the law for transgender individuals, as exemplified through successful claims of employment discrimination including <i>Glenn v. Brumby</i> , <i>Schroer v. Billington</i> , and the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission’s decision in <i>Macy v. Holder</i> .”
1586	Grade 11, p. 579	Line 1537, add inclusive language: “...people of color, and <u>lesbian</u> , gay, <u>bisexual</u> , and <u>transgender people</u> serving in the military.”
New suggestion based on letter from ACLU, NCLR, TLC, and Lambda	Grade 12, p. 595	Line 297-298 should be revised to read: “...and the LGBT community (<i>Lawrence v. Texas</i> (2003) and <i>Obergefell v. Hodges</i> (2015)).”
New suggestion based on letter from ACLU, NCLR, TLC, and Lambda	Grade 12, p. 595	Line 301, insert: “School-related cases of <i>Tinker v. Des Moines</i> (1969), <i>Fricke v. Lynch</i> (1980), <i>New Jersey v. T.L.O</i> (1985), <i>Henkle v. Gregory</i> (2001), or the 2013 Resolution Agreement announced by the United States Department of Education in <i>Student v. Arcadia Unified School District</i> offer additional perspectives relevant to students on free speech, privacy, non-discrimination, and civil rights for students in schools.
1611	Grade 12, p. 599	Line 388, add: “State and local governments can also provide additional non-discrimination protections not provided by the federal government (such as disability, immigration, employment, and LGBT rights).”
1697	Appendices, p. 790	Lines 277-281 should be revised to read: “Some western societies are still struggling with areas of civil rights that remain unresolved, such as marriage rights, <u>nondiscrimination protections</u> , and other issues of equality for their <u>lesbian</u> , gay, <u>bisexual</u> , and <u>transgender</u> citizens, but they can still provide leadership in applying global pressure against regimes that even in the twenty-first century mandate harsh penalties and sometimes even death against homosexuals <u>lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender people</u> .”

Again, we want to reiterate our commendation for the extensive edits related to the roles and contributions of LGBT people that you have included in this latest draft of the History-Social Science Framework. We thank the Subject Matter Committee for considering these remaining recommendations, which will help to ensure implementation of the FAIR Education Act and reflect the diversity of California's past as well as its present and future student and family population.

Should you have any questions regarding our recommendations, please contact Judy Appel at judy@ourfamily.org.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Judy Appel".

Judy Appel, Executive Director
Our Family Coalition

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Don Romesburg".

Don Romesburg, Member
Committee on LGBT History

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Rick Zbur".

Rick Zbur, Executive Director
Equality California

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Carolyn Laub".

Carolyn Laub, Consultant to LGBT Advocacy Organizations

cc: Commissioners, Instructional Quality Commission
Tom Adams, Executive Director, Instructional Quality Commission